From Majlis to Hashtag

The UAE NATIONAL BRAINSTORMING SESSION

ENGAGING CITIZENS THROUGH SOCIAL MEDIA

Published By:
The Governance and Innovation Program
Mohammed Bin Rashid School of Government

In Partnership with:
UAE MINISTRY OF CABINET AFFAIRS
GENERAL SECRETARIAT OF THE CABINET
Abstract

On an island located hundred kilometers off the shores of the capital city of Abu Dhabi, a UAE government retreat took place for all members of the Cabinet who gathered for two consecutive days in informal settings at the turn of the year. The ‘retreat’, held on ‘Sir Bani Yas’, the country’s largest natural reserve, discussed the outcomes of the ‘UAE Brainstorming Session’, a first-ever nation-wide technology-led citizen engagement initiative in the country.

The organizers’ objectives were highly ambitious in terms of process and expected outcomes: engage citizens through technological means to transform the country’s education and healthcare sectors. These two vital sectors have traditionally faced chronic challenges compared to the county’s strong performance globally in other developmental indicators. Given the wide diversity of the UAE society, an innovative solution was required first to identify the type and scope of the challenges faced by different segments in the society, and then come up with proper solutions on the micro and macro levels. The government has had few choices given that many reform initiatives launched, new authorities introduced and massive investments pumped in the two sectors over the past decade with only small incremental improvement in both sectors. It was clear for the government that to take vast leaps in terms of quality of services in the two sectors, people in the UAE, including all segments of the community, had to be brought into the picture, engaged and empowered to take part in the policy making and service re-design and improvement cycles.

Traditionally, the UAE experienced an informal participatory process of the ‘majlis’ (Arabic for council) where citizens interacted with rulers and community leaders to highlight problems and concerns in their communities in direct physical gatherings open to the public. However, until recently, there has never been a formal or even informal process in the UAE where the public was able to communicate directly and systematically en mass with the government –let alone take part directly in government services design or delivery.

The proposed concept was adopted at the highest levels in the government as the country’s first technology-based citizen engagement platform. The “UAE brainstorming session” initiative highly utilized the country’s solid information and communication technologies (ICT) infrastructure as well as the society’s strong social acceptance of ICTs, especially social media networks, in order to crowd-source solutions and ideas to enhance the quality of public services in both sectors. Eventually, thousands of people from all walks of life proactively and voluntarily took part by proposing more than 82,000 new ideas and innovative solutions using various social media channels. Many challenges in the country’s public health and education sectors were identified and targeted, effectively leading to new initiatives taking place on the ground.

Focusing on the utilization of social media in the process of citizen engagement in public service co-design and co-production, this case study documents the UAE brainstorming session process, highlights an innovative technology-based approach in citizen-government interactions and extracts lessons from local and regional contexts.
Over the past decade, the traditional view of the public as passive recipients of public services has shifted into recognizing the ‘customers’ or recipients of government services as co-producers and co-creators of public value as well as contributors to sustainable community development. This participatory model gains strength from the view that shifting towards ‘active’ public engagement brings about effective people empowerment; a necessary condition for sustainable development.

With rising public expectations, citizen-centric public services have become the key government ‘products’ required by citizens. Despite its location in a turbulent region facing numerous development challenges, the UAE is widely recognized as a global leader in enhancing the quality, efficiency and effectiveness of public sector services through creative approaches. The government has managed to develop multiple innovations in public service delivery through taking advantage of the country’s high internet penetration rates and the high level of technology acceptance in society. Whether by cutting time and costs through ‘electronic gates’ at the country’s borders or easing the lives of the public by introducing numerous online services through mobile and internet platforms, the ‘smart government’ services became the norm in the country. Over the last few years, the UAE society’s strong appetite for using social media in different facets of life is evident. This new medium is seen as the next frontier for the government to deliver services.

The penetration of social media in the UAE has been continuously increasing reaching around 60% of the population. With such critical mass of avid users of social networking technologies, the government started to actively take advantage of this ‘opportunity’ brought about by two clear factors: societal readiness and an enabling infrastructure. Recently, the UAE government became one of the few globally to explore utilizing these new societal informational flows to better gauge the needs of the public and inclusively develop better government services. This paper documents the steps and process, which took place during the ‘UAE brainstorming session’ as an innovative technology-based exercise of citizen engagement.

The United Arab Emirates is a federation of seven emirates: Abu Dhabi, Dubai, Sharjah, Ajman, Ras Al Khaimah, Fujairah and Umm Al Quwain with an overall population of more than 8.4 million people. The Federal Government consists of a Cabinet and all federal government entities. In addition, each emirate has its own local-level government entities. During the past four decades, the United Arab Emirates has managed to achieve strong developmental strides. The UAE’s economy occupies leading positions in several international economic indicators, with real GDP registering a growth rate of 4.4% and achieving US$ 280 billion in 2012 according to the latest official data. By 2014, the country has regained its pre-financial crisis growth levels, and is ranked today among the top twenty most competitive economies globally.

In terms of governance and public administration, the country has benefited from a visionary leadership in applying ‘future of government’ public service approaches. The country has sustainably enjoyed a clear global leading position in aggressive adoption of information and communication technologies (ICT) in public administration and governance. For example, the World Economic Forum ranks the UAE at the top of the world on the level of “Importance of ICT to Government Vision”; and second among 144 countries in “Government Success in ICT Promotion”. It also names the UAE as a “rising star” in the government ability to bridge the digital divide, while ranks it 9th worldwide on the level of “Government Online Services”. Similarly, according to the UN e-Government Readiness Index, the UAE is highlighted as a “frontrunner” and ranked 32nd worldwide overall in e-government readiness, and among the top twenty countries in the UN’s “online service delivery” index.

Overall, the society of the UAE has adopted the use of ICT with open arms in almost every facet of life. This strong embrace of technological means by both society and government suggests a healthy level of ‘technological trust’, or social acceptance of information and communication technologies. This is partly due to the solid technological infrastructure laid down by numerous innovative private-public partnerships over the past decades, which were coupled with government policies that actively promoted ICT use within the government and throughout society. These transformations have allowed the UAE to emerge as the regional leader in embracing information technologies and comfortably join the global trend of technology integration in government service design and delivery.

Due to sustained economic and social development, the UAE government managed to amass a comfortable reserve of ‘political trust’ among its citizens. According to the World Economic Forum’s Global Competitiveness Report, the perception of politicians’ honesty in the country has been sustainably high for years. For example, the UAE ranked third among 148 countries worldwide on the indicator measuring the “Public Trust in Politicians”, up from the ninth position in 2007. Steady economic growth, sustained development and political stability in a violently turbulent region have all provided the UAE government with a healthy reservoir of trust among its citizens.

History of Public Participation in the UAE

Since the foundation of the United Arab Emirates in 1971, the only formal participatory process that existed was the consultative assembly – named the Federal National Council (FNC) – which until 2006 was appointed by the rulers’ courts in the seven emirates that comprise the UAE. Set up on December 2nd, 1971, the FNC’s role was limited to proposing legislative amendments to the UAE cabinet.

However, informally, many countries in the Arab region, including the UAE experienced the traditional participatory process of the ‘majlis’ (Arabic for council) where citizens interacted with rulers and community leaders to highlight problems and concerns in their communities in direct physical gatherings held by the leaders and open to the public. This ‘majlis’ tradition continued in the UAE alongside the formal FNC as a channel of interaction between citizens and government.

Technology was formally introduced into the process of public participation in the UAE back in 2006. The government introduced electronic voting as a technology-led mechanism for public participation in electing members of the FNC, the first e-voting experience in the region. At the time, the number of participants in the e-voting process though was limited to 6,596 citizens in a government selected ‘electoral college’; a number which increased by twenty folds to 135,308 participants in the 2011 FNC election process in the UAE.

However, until recently, there has never been a formal or even informal process in the UAE where the public was able to communicate directly and systematically en mass with the government – let alone take part directly in government services design or delivery.

Today, citizen engagement and e-participation are strongly acknowledged as vital processes enhancing government efficiency and sustainable development in the country. The UAE government has taken expedited steps towards engaging larger segments of the public by utilizing the ubiquitous ICT in the country. Recently, the UAE ranked 13th globally in the UN “e-participation index” which measures the process of engaging citizens through ICTs in policy and decision-making in order to make public administration and service provision participatory, inclusive, collaborative and deliberative.

The impact of these public participation initiatives was clear on the levels of public satisfaction. A regional study conducted by MBRSIG’s Governance and Innovation Program found a clear co-relation between levels of citizen engagement on government services and levels of satisfaction with the public services provided. Across all government sectors, the research showed that service ratings submitted by customers who said that their governments regularly asked them for suggestions and input into the service design process were considerably higher than those submitted by their counterparts who said that they were never asked for input (Figure 1).


Figure 1: Impact of asking citizens for input on their satisfaction in public services in the Arab World. 

The Problem

The public sector in most Arab countries continues to suffer from mounting deficiencies in terms of quality, efficiency and accessibility of government services, specifically in terms of health and education. Despite the impressively high levels of government efficiency in public service delivery overall, the UAE seems to share similar challenges in the two sectors.

From a developmental viewpoint, international indicators confirm these two sectors as 'areas of improvement'. As evident in the international indicators, the country’s educational and healthcare services --two of the most critical services in developmental terms-- have ranked relatively low, compared to social, legal, economic and security services. For example, despite its impressive rankings in different competitiveness indicators globally, the UAE ranked relatively lower at 49 globally in health and education pillars according to the WEF’s Global Competitiveness Report. More recently, in a regional public survey conducted by the MBRSG’s Governance and Innovation Program, both “Education” and “Healthcare” were also the two government services with lowest rankings in terms of public satisfaction in their quality, efficiency and accessibility in the country (Figure 2).

The UAE has been aggressive in adopting ICTs, which contributed to enhancing the country's competitiveness and today ranks 5th globally in terms of quality of infrastructure, 7th on macroeconomic stability and 9th on government efficiency in international indicators.

---

However, such reports suggest lower rankings in terms of quality of education and healthcare services. The WEF Global Competitiveness Report suggested that:

"going forward, putting the country on a more stable development path will require further investment to boost health and educational outcomes. Raising the bar with respect to education will require not only measures to improve the quality of teaching and the relevance of curricula, but also measures to provide incentives for the population to attend schools at the primary and secondary levels."  

Healthcare and educational services are among the most accessed services by the public in the UAE; however, the different initiatives by the government seemed unable to increase the quality of such services to the expected level using traditional means. The UAE’s population is one of the most diverse culturally, socially and economically, due to the large number of communities active in the UAE economy. The vast diversity and complexity of the challenges experienced by the public made the problem even more difficult to solve.

Clearly, the challenges in the two critical sectors of health and education beg for innovative solutions, which take into account the massive cultural and economic diversity in the UAE’s society. Meanwhile, understanding the diverse needs of the different segments of the population is no easy task by any measure. For example, both the health and education sectors are jointly provided by the federal and local UAE government authorities as well as through the private sector. Addressing such challenges required a transformational approach that engages the widest possible segments of the public.

On the other hand, acknowledging the importance of government data availability in the age of open and big data, the UAE did manage to achieve several milestones in providing citizens with public information and access to informational services, reaching for example, a high score of 93% according to the UN’s ‘e-information’ indicator. However, the country has not yet reached similar levels in terms of ‘e-consultation’ and ‘e-decision making’ indicators measured by the UN, where the UAE ranks lower and stands at 72% and 33% respectively. ‘e-Consultation’ refers to the levels which governments engage public through for deeper contributions to and deliberation on public policies and services, while the ‘e-decision making’ indicator measures the level of people empowerment through co-design of policy options and co-production of service components and delivery. Despite the strong realization within the government of what needs to be done, the low scores of the latter two UN indicators highlight limitations and barriers for the UAE government in terms availability of channels and capacity for citizens engagement to achieve better public services.

A strong realization of this monumental challenge was clear in the government retreat. An innovative and revolutionary approach was needed to better understand the magnitude of the problem, and then come up with fitting solutions on the micro and macro levels. This first part of the problem seemed impossible to capture in a representative manner given the cultural diversity of the society in the country.

Governance and Innovation Program, Mohammed Bin Rashid School of Government

Stakeholders and Process

Since 2007, the UAE government established a tradition of holding a periodic solitary gathering for the Cabinet, known generally as the “cabinet retreat”. In this gathering, the Ministers have the opportunity to discuss various pressing subjects and review them away from the daily work pressures. The objective of the ‘retreat’ is to increase collaboration across government ministries, brainstorm critical issues and trigger innovative solutions in a less formal setting. The ‘retreat’ has always been supported and attended by some of the highest ranked government leaders.

A UAE Cabinet retreat was scheduled to take place on the 8th and 9th of December 2013 in ‘Sir Bani Yas Island’, a natural reserve and habitat for wildlife and endangered species founded by the late Sheikh Zayed bin Sultan Al Nahyan, the founder of the nation. The symbolism of the place sent a strong message. In this calm and isolated setting, the ministers were to debate hundreds of creative ideas for developing the health and education sectors in the country, two of the most critical public sectors.

On December 3rd 2013, a highly promoted call was issued by the UAE Prime Minister through traditional and online media venues where he called all citizens and residents in the country to join the “biggest ever” national brainstorming session in the world on the state of health and education sectors, urging them to generate innovative and fresh ideas. Most innovative and practical proposals received from the public were to be discussed at the high-level dedicated two-day ‘Cabinet retreat’ the week after.

The public was encouraged to submit ideas, proposals and solutions to health and education challenges either directly via the official website of the Prime Minister or through dedicated email address that was created and shared widely with the public. The public was also invited to use their mobile phones to send video comments with their suggestions. Additionally, thousands of active

14. A list of the timeline of all 38 tweets covering the Brainstorming Session in Arabic and English by the UAE Prime Minister is provided in the Annex.
social media users in the country were asked to tweet their ideas using designated hashtags in Arabic and English.\(^{15}\)

The key idea behind the brainstorming session was that the cabinet would benefit from engaging the public in a systematic way to enrich their discussions with new and innovative ideas. The organizers hoped that this would help the government assess the state of the health and education sectors and understand pressing public issues better based on firsthand public experiences, complementing expert advice and secondary research.

A dedicated team was formed within the UAE’s Ministry of Cabinet Affairs and was entrusted with managing the first countrywide technology-led initiative to engage the public on two pressing issues: understanding the challenges in health and education services from the public perspective, as well as seek creative solutions based on the public experiences. The team was tasked with collecting, analyzing and categorizing the received proposals and ideas before submitting them to the Cabinet retreat for deliberation. Embracing a large overflow of information, there were two human-led shortlisting phases applied to the information, the first managed by the team receiving the submissions in the Ministry of Cabinet Affairs, and a second phase by a more involved team within the cabinet retreat.

Ultimately, the response far exceeded expectations, with 50,000 participations received in the first three days of the campaign on 6th of December 2013. Based on the suggestions during the first days of the campaign, a decision was made by the organizers that selected members of the public representing different segments of the stakeholders in society are to take part physically in the retreat to share their ideas with the Cabinet. Teachers, doctors, nurses, parents, school administrators and students were invited. For example, Shamma Khalid, a student with special needs, was invited to attend the cabinet retreat in person and discuss ideas and proposals she posted in a video in response to the brainstorming call. The video provided a firsthand view on the challenges facing people with special needs in the education sector in the UAE.

By December 8th, on the first day of the retreat, the reach of the campaign was not limited to the UAE boundaries anymore, with 65,000 ideas and participations received overall by the team; many of them suggested by people living outside the country. Regardless of the geographic origin of the idea, the Prime Minister thanked the participants from overseas, and tweeted that the Cabinet will consider those ideas.

\(^{15}\) The official website of Prime Ministry is www.uaepm.ae . The email address used for the brainstorming session was: brainstorming@uaepm.ae. The Twitter hashtags initiated for the session in Arabic and English were: “#الإماراتي_الذهني_العصف” and “#UAEbrainstorm.”
By the last day of the brainstorming campaign on December 9th 2013, there were 82,000 ideas and proposals received. Every single idea, proposal or participation was recorded in a special portal that was created internally to tally the public participation. The organizing team was collecting, categorizing, sampling and shortlisting the ideas and proposal received. These were categorized under five pillars for each of the two sectors.

For the education sector, these pillars were:

1. Teachers Quality: How to enhance efficiency and competency of teachers and add value to the teaching career itself;
2. Teaching Methodology: Developing innovative teaching methods, integrating technology and applying international standards in this field;
3. Upskilling Students: Enhancing students’ skills and ranking to meet students standards in developed countries;
4. Higher Education: Means to improve ratios of students who complete high school, university and postgraduate studies; and
5. Aligning Educational Output: Integrating educational outputs with present and future requirements of the different sectors of the UAE economy.

The pillars in the healthcare sector were:

1. Quality of Services: Raising the quality of healthcare services for the public and private sector;
2. Competence of Healthcare Staff: Enhancing the efficiency and competence of the healthcare staff, while promoting careers in health care;
3. Specialized Health Services: Developing specialized medical services across the country;
4. Lifestyle Services: Transform lifestyle patterns to improve general health; and
5. Prevention: Measures to limit the spread of diseases within society.

Finally, ideas were submitted in a special report to the Cabinet retreat. The first day of the retreat was dedicated to discussing education-related proposed ideas submitted through the campaign, while the second day was dedicated for healthcare related proposals.
Social Media?! Why Social Media?

“We need new tools, different ways of doing things and continuous innovation in the light of world’s competitive environment,”

Sheikh Mohammed bin Rashid Al Maktoum
UAE Vice President, Prime Minister, and Ruler of Dubai

The UAE society is widely recognized as ‘tech-savvy’ and the government in the UAE has traditionally been active in pursuing reform and modernization methods through technological means, especially in terms of public service delivery. Successful initiatives in promoting ICT use in service delivery, coupled with solid physical and regulatory infrastructure, are the key factors contributing to the country’s continued high rankings in ICT readiness indicators.

The positive public response here towards using social media for citizen engagement in public service in the UAE is not surprising. Earlier findings of multiple public surveys conducted by MBRSG’s Governance and Innovation Program confirm the positive perception held by the public generally towards interacting with government entities through social media. Most respondents in that national research project agreed that the benefits presented by engagement through social media for service delivery included: improved quality of services, increased service accessibility, inclusiveness and reduced costs. It is clear that people in the UAE have high expectations and positive views of the advantages of using social media for service delivery. The receptiveness of UAE customers to social media driven citizen engagement efforts appeared to be high. This presented the Brainstorming Session team with a fertile ground to develop government initiatives aimed at involving citizens in the service design and delivery process using technological means.

Similarly, government employees in the UAE hold positive views towards utilizing technology and social networking technologies to enhance government operation. For years, the UAE has been at the forefront of adopting information technology in government. Even before the proliferation of social media technologies in the country, a study conducted in 2009 on trust, technology and collaboration in the UAE’s public sector, in fact indicates that government employees in the UAE have long realized the potential of social Web 2.0 tools. A majority of respondents in that study considered utilizing social networking tools a key tool for fostering collaboration and trust within and between government agencies. This perception continued to be evident in a research that is more recent where citizen engagement through technology, and specifically social media, was viewed positively by government employees individually and institutionally.

Over the last two years, the UAE government started to institutionalize the use of social media by government entities and launched multiple guidelines regulating and enhancing the use by government entities and the public. With more than 82 million users of social media users in the Arab region, the UAE also launched a set of pan-Arab awards promoting positive uses of social media in the Arab region to “harness the positive potential of social media for the good of the Arab world” 19. However, nothing sums up the vast influence of social media in the country better than a couple of tweets made by Sheikh Mohammed, UAE Vice President, Prime Minister and Ruler of Dubai, an active social media user himself, when he thanked his six million followers on Twitter, Facebook, Instagram and Google+ and called social media channels an “open parliament that cannot be ignored or misled” (Figure 3). The organizing team realized this vision stating “the trend for the future is that more and more stable governments around the world will be involved with their communities through Social Media. The UAE is well positioned to be the number one government when it comes to social media interaction with its community.”

19. Arab Social Media Awards: http://www.arabsocialmediaaward.ae/
The cabinet retreat has drawn overwhelming popular participation with 82,000 public ideas and suggestions received via social media platforms and the different channels on the Prime Minister’s website.

Demographic analysis of the ideas and proposals received through the Prime Ministry’s website indicates that around 56 percent of them came from women inside and outside the UAE; a surprising response given that less than 30 percent of social media users in the UAE are women. Participations on the Prime Ministry’s portal during the brainstorming session mostly came from those between 30-40 years old (around 45 percent), followed by those between 40-50 years old. In contrast, if we take the demographic breakdown of Facebook users as an example, 48 percent of social media in the UAE are youth between 15 and 29 years old, while 52 percent are over 30 years old. The participations from older age groups made sense, as they are the segments of society who are the primary ‘customers’ of public health and education services.

The public feedback was not limited to online participations, as representatives of students, teachers, parents, school administrators, doctors, nurses and other specialists in the health and education sectors were also invited to share their feedback in person during the Cabinet retreat.

Overall, the brainstorming session lasted less than a week and ended on the 9th of December 2013 with the closing of the Cabinet retreat. The objectives originally set by the organizers of the brainstorming initiative were:

- Citizen Engagement: Involve the community in government decision-making processes, giving them a direct role in influencing government decisions and contributing to government strategies;
- Development: Encourage citizens to participate in developing health and education sectors in the country;
- Ideation: Contribute to establishing a “Government Innovation Laboratory” in the cabinet retreat, where members of the cabinet can review and discuss the ideas submitted by the public;
- Citizen Centricity: Encourage the citizenry to participate in making positive changes to their lives and contribute to improving the top two most vital and critical sectors in the UAE, health and education, based on first-hand view of the many challenges and obstacles they face;
- Collaboration: Utilize the possibilities offered by information and communication technologies (ICT) to collaborate with the public for better services;
- Partnership: Create a creative partnership between the public sector agencies and the citizenry through embracing modern communications modes especially, social media; and
- Trust: Build a stronger level of trust between government and people better information exchanges using social media, in a serious shift from the one-way communication flow, which prevailed in the government.
By the end of the exercise, there were strong indications that many of these set objectives were achieved either fully or partially. The actual outcomes surpassed expectations and can be summarized in the following:

- Crowdsourcing solutions for existing and identified public service problems: The public produced new solutions to solve identified problems in health and education public services;
- Identifying new problems in existing public service: Many new problems in existing services were identified through public participations;
- Identifying indirect negative impact of existing services: The brainstorming session provided the government with invaluable insights and awareness about unintended negative impact of existing government services, which can be mitigated;
- New Public Services: The process was an excellent platform for ideation of new government services. Ideas for new services were provided by the public to be developed by the government;
- Doing Things Better: The public generated innovative ideas that can enhance government functionality in certain services; and
- New communication channels between the government and the public: As an outcome of the process itself, the government felt that it now enjoys a direct communication link with the UAE community, unseen anywhere in the history of the country.

Practically, based on the outcomes of the brainstorming initiative, the UAE government has in fact initiated a number of projects. One example was establishing the “UAE Medical Board”. The idea of the Medical Board started as a tweet from a member of the public, Omar Al-Hamadi during the brainstorming session. It evolved into an official government project after the Cabinet approved it during the retreat a few days later.

By creating the ‘UAE National Institute for Medical Specializations’ (or the UAE Medical Board) which aims to develop and upgrade the health sector in the UAE, the government has effectively set an example in empowering a segment of the citizenry.
Overall, a large number of innovative ideas were generated. Examples of the other innovative shortlisted and approved ideas in the healthcare sector included:

- Mobile healthcare services approved, delivering medical services to people, particularly those living in distant areas, and providing primary healthcare services for the elderly;
- A program for evaluating private hospitals and clinics in terms of waiting time, satisfaction with services, average days of stay, and success rate of surgeries;
- Approving a comprehensive medical screening program for citizens, with the aim of enhancing disease prevention measures;
- Preparing a professional and organizational structure for the government health sector and developing career path plans to make the profession more attractive;
- Standardizing benchmarks of accrediting doctors and healthcare professionals across the country;
- Introducing unified national standards for all hospitals in the country to ensure a common standard for quality of provided medical services;
- Launching cancer early detection program to ensure early detection and treatment;
- Launching a national database for medical records to facilitate the transfer of a patient between public and private hospitals;
- Approving a number of measures for combatting obesity and encouraging a healthy lifestyle, such as specifying portions and sizes of carbonated beverages, introducing restrictions on advertisements for unhealthy foods, displaying calories on products;
- Implementing a strategy to set up National Centers for Research and Development in the medical sector in cooperation with academic institutions in the country;
• Setting up a nationwide cancer register to ensure supervision and prevention of the disease;
• Setting up a technical training center for continuous training of health professionals;
• Launching a stimulus program to attract more Emiratis to the nursing profession;
• Implementing an integrated program to promote public awareness about healthy lifestyle to increase prevention; and
• Introducing common standards for healthy food in all government and private schools.

On public education services, there were also several new initiatives announced and endorsed by the Cabinet during its retreat based on the brainstorming session. For example:

• Launch of the teacher career progress and development system, and career advancement measures for teachers in order to make the profession attractive, encourage competition, excellence, and achieve job satisfaction for teachers;
• Study to abolish the system of branching for the literary and science sections, and shifting to the educational system that combines compulsory and optional subjects for students in order to keep pace with the world’s growing knowledge and rapid technological developments;
• Launch of systems to evaluate schools and publish detailed reports on the academic performance to increase competitiveness among the schools and assist the school administrations to specify areas they need improvement periodically;
• A program to attract distinguished graduates to teaching to ensure employment of talented cadres given importance of teacher in terms of education feedback;
• A specialized training program for teachers to improve their skills and keep pace with the latest teaching methods, as well as teaching subjects on culture, innovative and creative skills, arts, music and sports;
• Cancellation of a foundation year at universities through development of subjects at the secondary school level to match the university requirements;
• A project to classify and evaluate public and private universities in the UAE as per unified standards. Periodic reports on the evaluation will be published;
• Introduction of new subjects to develop the leadership and life skills for students;
• Endorsement of licensing system for teachers in accordance with the certified standards;
• Evaluation of educational performance at public and private kindergartens, being the cornerstone of education system;
• Provision of electronic platform on the curricula in form of video lessons to help in self-education and fight the private tuitions;
• Setting of full system to detect talented students to develop them; and
• Launch of the academic guide system for students to help them choose future academic specialization in a way that matches requirements of national economy.
Clearly, the levels of interaction between the UAE government and citizens have increased rapidly. More importantly, it can be argued that one of the most promising outcomes of the brainstorming session is that it effectively infused and set a new culture of “citizen engagement” within the Federal Government of the UAE. The idea of citizen participation in public services development and co-production is not ‘dangerous’ anymore. The brainstorming session has created a cultural shift among the government authorities and employees, raising awareness on the benefits of engaging the public for better governance.

At the wider level, the impact of the brainstorming session on citizen satisfaction about public education and healthcare services are yet to be measured. The two sectors are ranked the lowest in terms of satisfaction in their quality, efficiency and accessibility as per national research conducted just before the brainstorming session. There is a need to carry out wider research to evaluate the impact of the exercise on public satisfaction in the two sectors. However, it is safe to say that the public now feels ownership as these vital services are being developed inclusively.

Additionally, the UAE enjoyed sustained comfortable levels of trust in government as evident in multiple international indicators, even before any degree of citizen engagement in public service delivery was practiced formally. It would also be safe to argue that the levels of trust in government, due this national exercise will only increase the levels of trust and confidence among citizens. This in turn will most likely affect the view and ranking of the UAE in international indicators of competitiveness and e-participation.

Ultimately, the experience of the “Government Innovation Lab” taking place through the cabinet retreat, where members of the cabinet reviewed and discussed the ideas submitted by the public through technological means was an instant hit. As a result, after the session, the UAE Prime Minister directed the government to make the “Government Innovation Lab” exercise as an official standard practice in citizen engagement for public service development in all Federal government entities. The Ministry of Cabinet Affairs is tasked to set formal guidelines for operating the “Government Innovation Lab” to be adopted at different government levels.

Probably nothing sums up the success of the process of engaging the citizens better than this quote by the Sheikh Mohammed bin Rashid Al Maktoum, UAE Vice President, Prime Minister and Ruler of Dubai at the closing of the Cabinet retreat: “Our people are creative. Many of the ideas we received were outstanding. We promise everybody that the development of healthcare and education will not stop.”

Analysis and Conclusions

Over the past decade, the traditional view of the public as passive recipients of public services has shifted into recognizing the ‘customers’ or recipients of government services as co-producers or co-creators of public value and services; and as contributors to sustainable community development. This participatory model gains strengths from the assumption that a shift to ‘active’ engagement with the public effectively brings about better people empowerment, a condition necessary for sustainable development.

Primarily, this case study aimed to understand the current utilization patterns by the UAE Federal Government of technology, and social media tools specifically, for the purpose of enhancing the service delivery process, in light of the readiness of both the public and government for advanced implementation of technological approaches for service delivery in the UAE. The massive socio-technological transformations that took place in the UAE over the past two decades have effectively flattened informational hierarchies, changed trust models both in society and between citizens and government, re-defined some societal leadership characteristics, altered organizational structures and transformed the landscape of public service and policymaking cycles significantly. The government reached a realization today that it needs to proactively engage citizens and partner with societal structures as well as with the private sector, to find innovative ways for delivering public services that are inclusive, citizen-centric, responsive, timely and cost-effective.

The ideals and objectives of the UAE brainstorming process are fully aligned with the stated vision of the government. Building a nation that is ‘united in responsibility, destiny, knowledge and prosperity’ is at the core of the official UAE vision 2021. Effective, efficient and inclusive public services are key elements of achieving these ambitious goals, which would be difficult to imagine without citizen engagement. Additionally, harnessing human capital through citizen sourcing and collaboration helps develop a “competitive economy driven by knowledgeable and innovative Emiratis”. The UAE Federal government has long emphasized the importance of service delivery and excellence in government. The current government strategy, for example, includes high quality citizen-centric services as one of its seven driving principles.

The findings of this case study suggest that citizen engagement is contributing to building an “ambitious and confident nation” by infusing a sense of responsibility among the public and government workers, as well as building stronger communities. The process of the brainstorming session itself was the widest ever exercise of public deliberation in the country. Effectively, it encouraged citizens to become active stakeholders in the development of their communities. One could argue that the process itself is leading to a greater societal cohesion and sense of community among the different segments of society, which took part of the process. In other words, the process of engaging the public through the social web itself, may be leading to developing ‘social trust’ in the UAE, which refers to citizens’ confidence in their peers as members of one social community that shares common goals and objectives.

What the brainstorming sessions demonstrated is that the public is willing to positively react and contribute to the government decision-making process. The government came to realize that this engagement widens its perspective and helps it understand better and make sense of the real perceptions of the people on individual and community levels. Not only were there great ideas generated, but hundreds were calling for more similar initiatives in other sectors across the government. The organizing team realized that “the initiative gave thousands of Emiratis and residents, a sense of higher responsibility. What is important now is to demonstrate to all those participants that at least some of their ideas have been adopted and that more initiatives of this scale will be launched on a regular basis”.

The case of the UAE brainstorming session was a countrywide exploratory initiative of innovatively using the social web for citizen engagement for better public services. The strong public readiness to engage with the government online and the positive attitudes towards the use of social media prevail amongst UAE citizens and residents. The government took advantage of the high ICT penetration and technological readiness in the UAE society. The increased penetration and influence of social media in Arab society has largely been viewed by governments as a risk and a threat. In contrast, few avant garde governments in the region had the vision to see the new ways of how information flows in their society as an opportunity. In the Arab region, even fewer enjoyed the level of political trust and leadership trait that enabled them to take practical steps to try to reap benefits out of this reality and crowd-source innovative ideas from the public, let alone take actions based on these ideas.

Was using technology and social media a success factor for this initiative? Technology may have played an important role in widening social acceptance of participatory processes, through increasing transparency and empowering citizens, thus enhancing trust in government. However, the critical mass of users and societal readiness to apply technological innovations alone would not have been sufficient for this initiative to succeed. A certain level of trust in government was a prerequisite for this technology-enabled participatory process to take place, regardless of the e-readiness level in the country.
Lessons Learned and Way Forward

After less than a year, several conclusions can be drawn from the first-ever national brainstorming initiative to take place in the country. To transform this experience into a government-wide mode of operation, the lessons extracted from this experience may prove useful for similar future initiatives:

- **Planning:** As a pioneering initiative, the brainstorming session was carried out in a tight timeframe. The organizers worked under tight deadlines in line with directions that aimed to identify communities’ needs as soon as possible. Better planning is required as well as more involvement of government entities and government leaders and professionals. In addition, there is a need to plan a central platform to receive proposals and ideas from the community.

- **Resource Allocation:** As this is unchartered territory, the organizing team was not expecting the magnitude of the response. Underestimating the societal readiness to be engaged in reforming public service may have caused improper allocation of human resources in advance. Resources allocated specifically for the use of technology and social media in citizen engagement for service design and delivery is generally limited in the government. Few government entities allocate human resources for crowd-sourcing, information collection and big data analysis of information from social media pages and accounts.

- **Big Data and Information Overload:** Advanced big data tools were needed in the collection phase during the social media brainstorming session. For example, the team found Twitter to be more difficult than expected as a platform to collect information from tens of thousands of posts without using advanced data analysis tools. Going forward, the application of big data analysis tools will reveal even more insightful findings for the government, especially if this process was to be standardized across government entities.

- **Government Collaboration:** With high levels of internet, smart phone, and social media penetration, the initiative may have included representative samples of a large segment of the society; however, given the exploratory nature of the initiative, it was not inclusive of all necessary government entities. Several government entities could have been more involved during different phases of the initiative.

- **Framework for Better Engagement:** The UAE government has developed government-wide social media guidelines for using these tools in the government. This may need to be extended to view these tools as potential citizen engagement methods where fitting guidelines and frameworks are developed.

- **Segmentation for Better Ideation:** The amount and scope of good ideas generated have been overwhelming. Extracting more targeted ideas may need better segmentation of the communities engaged and using the appropriate tools that fit their needs. For example, to generate more fitting ideas and solutions on a specific technical problem in the health sector may require targeting experts in that field specifically using the social media channels they are more active on.

- **Diversification of Channels:** Demographic analysis of using social media tools in the UAE indicates that some platforms are more popular with youth in the UAE, such as video-sharing tools, while microblogging platforms like Twitter are more popular with citizens and platforms.
like Facebook are more popular with expatriates in the UAE. The languages of the targeted communities are another important factor. As the UAE is a multi-cultural and multi-lingual society with over 200 nationalities working in its economy, diversifying social media channels and using those, which are popular with certain communities, is important. Eventually, more social media platforms should be explored based on the targeted segment in society to be engaged.

- **Localization:** As the UAE is a federation with multiple layers of government providing public services to the public, local governments can also learn from this case and adapt similar strategies in involving their communities in co-design and co-delivery of public services. The organizing team may have to run workshops across governments with a focus on the brainstorming case and citizen engagement through social media in general.

- **Sustainable Citizen Engagement:** A cultural shift has been set by example for the UAE government, where citizen engagement for better governance and public services has become an accepted practice. To maintain long-term benefit beyond the hype of the success of the initiative, citizen engagement through ICT in the UAE should not be a one-time event. It should only mark a beginning.

Electronic participation approaches in general and applications of the social web in particular can play a crucial role in decreasing information asymmetry between the government and its citizenry. Based on a case study on the UAE national brainstorming session through social media, this case study provided an in-depth view of the success factors, challenges and extracted lessons. The impact of the public trust in the government and the societal readiness for utilizing the social web to engage with the government are not to be underestimated. The process itself can play a major role in making the public service design process more transparent and inclusive, leading to greater citizens’ satisfaction and participation in co-production of public service and in government policy-making generally, some of the cornerstones of good governance. In turn, this inclusive process, if embraced as a modus operandi in the government, will contribute to enhance levels of trust in government, paving the way for stronger partnership between the public and the government as well as smoother sustainable development efforts.

"The source of new innovation and ideas, whether from citizens, employees or specialists, will never deplete and this is one of principles of action of our government." These comments made by Sheikh Mohammed bin Rashid Al Maktourm, UAE Vice President, Prime Minister and Ruler of Dubai during the closing remarks of the Cabinet retreat made it clear that this understanding is instilled deep in the DNA of the government. In other words, engaging the citizens for better governance is here to stay. With the strong adoption of digital governance and smart cities initiatives in the country, it is a matter of time until technical innovation enables a seamless inclusive engagement process. The UAE may not have a fully developed system for participatory governance in place yet, but engaging a tech-savvy society through digital means in an environment of trust, coupled with systematic ‘big data’ approaches may prove as inclusive as traditional participatory models. The UAE government seems to have successfully taken the first step in the long journey.
Acknowledgements

The author would like to thank the UAE Ministry of Cabinet Affairs for the wealth of data and information provided for writing this case study. This case study was authored by:

Fadi Salem, Director of the Governance and Innovation Program at the Mohammed Bin Rashid School of Government.

To contact the author, please direct emails to: fadi.salem@mbrsg.ac.ae

The views expressed in this report are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of the trustees, officers and other staff of the Mohammed Bin Rashid School of Government (MBRSG).

© 2014 Governance and Innovation Program, Mohammed Bin Rashid School of Government
The Governance and Innovation Program (GIP), MBRSG

Established in 2006, The Governance and Innovation Program (GIP) at MBRSG continues to produce cutting-edge policy research and develop programmatic activities focusing on government innovation and developmental policies through information technologies in the Arab states. The Program has been influencing policy making in cutting-edge ‘future of government’ areas and continue to have strong regional impact on policy discourses in the Arab region, though its evidence-based applied research, direct advisory and collaborative projects. This impact has been widely recognized regionally and globally by international organizations, policy making circles as well as scholarly networks.

The objectives of the program are aligned with regional governments’ objectives towards nurturing a culture of innovation in society, promoting participatory, inclusive and transparent government models; and enabling more responsive and efficient governance through effective adoption of information technologies. Since its establishment, the projects and initiatives of the Program have spanned the following policy topics, among other ‘future of government’ areas:

- Innovative and Open Governance
- ‘Smart government’ and smart cities development
- E-Government and mGovernment policies, strategies and assessment in the Arab region
- Social Media impact and Government 2.0 in the Arab World
- Whole-of-Government initiatives and Public Sector Collaboration
- Innovation policies in Arab public sector
- Citizen Engagement and e-Voting
- Youth and Entrepreneurship
- ICT for Development
- Government Transformation and Future of Government Services
- Government Information and Data and the impact on Knowledge Economy
The Mohammed Bin Rashid School of Government

The Mohammed bin Rashid School of Government (formerly Dubai School of Government) is a research and teaching institution focusing on public policy in the Arab world. Established in 2005 under the patronage of HH Sheikh Mohammed Bin Rashid Al Maktoum, Vice President and Prime Minister of the United Arab Emirates and Ruler of Dubai, in cooperation with the Harvard Kennedy School, the School aims to promote good governance through enhancing the region’s capacity for effective public policy.

Toward this goal, the Mohammed bin Rashid School of Government also collaborates with regional and global institutions in its research and training programs. In addition, the School organizes policy forums and international conferences to facilitate the exchange of ideas and promote critical debate on public policy in the Arab world. The School is committed to the creation of knowledge, the dissemination of best practice and the training of policy makers in the Arab world. To achieve this mission, the School has developed strong capabilities to support research and teaching programs including:

- Applied research in governance, public policy and management;
- Master’s degrees in public policy and public administration;
- Executive education for senior officials and executives; and,
- Knowledge forums for thought leaders, scholars and policy makers.
Annex

List of all Tweets on the ‘Brainstorming Session’ made from the official account of Sheikh Mohammed bin Rashid Al Maktoum, UAE Vice President, Prime Minister, and Ruler of Dubai:

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 9
We received more than 82K ideas, thanks to everyone’s participation in #uaebrainstorm. Executing the selected ideas is our challenge now

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 9
Govt, people from the field & citizens agreed on the most important ideas for the health sector. Now we move into execution #uaebrainstorm

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 9
Today we concluded our ministerial retreat . We launched a set of initiatives for the health sector #uaebrainstorm pic.twitter.com/rPxXVv5mOM

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 9
أشكر كل من ساهم في إنجاح #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي .. والذي وصلت مجموع أفكاره 82 ألف فكرة خلال أقل من أسبوع ..والتحدي الآن هو في التنفيذ ..

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 9
الحكومة وشعب الإمارات هم فريق عمل واحد .. الأفكار متنوعة ومبدعة .. والرؤية موحدة .. والتنفيذ سيكون مشترك #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 9
تطوير الخدمات الطبية أولوية حكومية. صحة مواطنينا لا تقاس بتكلفة، والعلاج أينما وجد فهوم حق لههم #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي_الإماراتي pic.twitter.com/kn4JcLhFro

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 9
تلقينا الكثير من الاقتراحات المميزة من مشاركين من الدول الشقيقة. وأخذنا بعضها كذكرى لجهدهم للإمارات ومشاركتهم معا #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 9
اتفقنا مع الحكومة ومع أهل الميدان ومع شعب الإمارات على أهم الأفكار في القطاع الطبي ..والمرحلة القادمة مرحلة تنفيذ وعمل #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي
HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 9

انتهينا بحمد الله من أعمال الخلوة الوزارية..وأطلقنا مجموعة من المبادرات لتطوير القطاع الطبي pic.twitter.com/lZnt07APJ9

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8

Tomorrow will be dedicated for discussion of the creative and constructive Healthcare-related ideas that we received. #uaebrainstorm

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8

Ministers discussed plenty of ideas on increasing teacher competence, upgrading teaching methods, &enhancing student skills #uaebrainstorm

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8

I usually brainstorm with small teams, but I wanted to try it with my people. The result was more than 65,000 ideas. #uaebrainstorm

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8

We concluded the first day of the ministerial retreat dedicated for discussion of education-related ideas submitted on #uaebrainstorm

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8

غدا بإذن الله سيتم تخصيصه بالكامل لمناقشة الأفكار الإبداعية والإيجابية التي وردتنا لتطوير قطاع الصحة بالدولة #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8

تم طرح الكثير من الأفكار المميزة اليوم .. واعتمدنا بعضها . وأجلنا الأفكار الأخرى لدراسةها من الفرق الوزارية المتخصصة #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8

استمعنا للطالبة شما خالد حول متطلبات أصحاب الاحتياجات الخاصة .وقدمها للمجلس أخي سيف بن زايد pic.twitter.com/IMEJA0GpTN

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8

ناقش الوزراء الكثير من الأفكار لرفع كفاءة المعلمين وتغيير طرق التدريس وزيادة مهارات الطلبة #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي pic.twitter.com/PJUPexiEW
HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8
جرت العصف الذهني مع الفرق الصغيرة.. وأحببت أن أجريه مع شعبي .. والنتيجة 65 ألف فكرة
pic.twitter.com/ZKNrZWNiq
العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8
انتهينا من اليوم الأول للخلوة الوزارية التي خصصنا لمناقشة أفكار #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي لتطوير
قطاع التعليم
pic.twitter.com/7ofC0Ld8lH

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 8
نبذًا بحمد الله اليوم أعمال الخلوة الوزارية بجزيرة صير بني ياس .. كل الشكر لمن شارك في
العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي
pic.twitter.com/xALsp98nsV

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 6
فريق العمل سيستمر في استقبال أفكاركم حتى التاسع من ديسمبر على موقع
أو في تويتر عبر الوسم #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي http://www.uaepm.ae

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 6
كثير من الأفكار مبدعة ومتميزة كما تعودنا منكم ... وحجم المشاركة الإيجابية يضع جميع الوزراء أمام
مسئولية مضاعفة.

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 6
أشكر تفاعل الجميع مع #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي لتطوير قطاعي الصحة والتعليم .. وصلتنا حتى الآن
 أكثر من 50 ألف فكرة
pic.twitter.com/Cy3lFmKsoz

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 5
تجربة #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي تعبر عن إيماننا التام بأهمية الحوار .. وتبادل الأفكار .. ومشاركة العقول
من أجل وضع الحلول

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 5
أهمل الميدان هم اللقرب والنسب لمناقشة كافة الأفكار التي وردتنا في #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي
وأريدهم أن يناقشوها مع مجلس الوزراء

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd  •  Dec 5
وجهنا اليوم بإشراك ممثلين من الميدان من المعلمين والأطباء ومدراء المدارس والطلاب وأولياء الأمور
في الخلوة الوزارية #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي
HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 5
الأخوة والأخوات .. أشكر الجميع على تفاعلكم الإيجابي مع #العصف_الذهني_الإماراتي .. أفكار مميزة واقتراحات إبداعية كما نعودنا منكم

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 3
Through these two days we will discuss many positive ideas. I am optimistic for the contributions and our ability to develop these sectors

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 3
We will dedicate our ministerial retreat to creating positive ideas that unite us all towards a single purpose

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 3
Please submit suggestions at http://www.uaepm.ae , email video comments to brainstorming@uaepm.ae, and tweet ideas to #uaebrainstorm

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 3
We want every man, woman and child to join us in the biggest ever national brainstorm session to find new ideas for health and education

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 3
Education and health concern all of us, so I invite all of UAE society to think collectively of creative solutions

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 3
UAE govt. is having a cabinet retreat that will be dedicated to further develop the health and education sectors

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 3
تطوير التعليم والصحة في الدولة مسئولية وطنية مشتركة .. ونعودنا من شعبينا على الأفكار والحلول الإبداعية والمتحدة

HH Sheikh Mohammed @HHShkMohd • Dec 3
سنناقش عبر يومين الكثير من الأفكار الإيجابية .. ومتفائل بالمشاركات ونقدرنا على التطوير في هذين القطاعين
الجميع صغاراً وكباراً نساءً ورجالاً نريد منهم تزويدنا بالآفكار والاقتراحات لتطوير التعليم الصحة. نريد أكبر جلسة عصف ذهني وطني لمناقشة حلول جديدة.

أريد إشراك جميع أفراد المجتمع في هذه الخلوة، قضايا التعليم والصحة تمسنا جميعاً. نريد أن نتوحد حولهما وأن ندعم أفكارا جديدة في التطوير.

الأخوة والأخوات...سنقيم خلوة وزارية خلال الأيام القادمة مع جميع الوزراء لمدة يومين. قرنا تخصيص اليومين لمناقشة تطوير قطاعي الصحة والتعليم.
Bibliography


